

**REGULAR MEETING
OF THE SAN MARINO DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE
SEPTEMBER 7, 2016 - 7:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Frank Hsu called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chairman Frank Hsu, Committee Member John Dustin, Committee Member Kevin Cheng, Committee Member Corinna Wong, Alternate Committee Member Judy Johnson-Brody, Alternate Committee Member Chris Huang.

ABSENT: Vice-Chair William Dietrick

APPEAL PROCEDURE

Chairman Frank Hsu gave an explanation of the Design Review Committee procedures and explanation of the fifteen-day appeal procedure to the members of the audience.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Chairman Frank Hsu announced that he had a conversation with the Planning Director, Aldo Cervantes, and suggested that a summary of the Committee Members' discussions be included in the meeting minutes for items to be continued. A summary of discussions would help the committee members to remember what their concerns on a particular agenda item were; the committee members would then be able to determine whether or not those issues have been properly addressed by the applicant's resubmittal. Currently, the DRC meeting minutes are Action Minutes only.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**1. DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE CASE NO. DRC16-47
2838 WOODLAWN AVENUE, (LIU/TJ MEC CONSTRUCTION SERVICES)**

Planning Intern San presented the project and stated staff's support for the project. She also stated that the application was continued from the meeting of August 3, 2016.

Owen Hale, project designer, presented the revised project, explained the exterior lighting selection, and answered questions from the Committee.

The following people spoke in opposition of the project:

Fran Benuska, 2410 Coniston Place, the proposed design is taking a step backward on the house's street appeal.

Chairman Hsu stated that the proposed enclosure takes away from the original charm of the home. Additionally, the entryways in the neighborhood are either flashed or recessed which is opposite of the proposed design and therefore incompatible with the neighborhood.

Committee Member Wong moved to approve the project as submitted. Second by Committee Member Cheng. AYES: Committee Member Cheng, Committee Member Dustin, Committee Member Wong, and Alternate Committee Member Johnson-Brody. NOES: Chairman Hsu.

**2. DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE CASE NO. DRC16-39
2968 GAINSBOROUGH DRIVE, (REK AURORA INC/DAHL ARCHITECTS INC)**

Assistant Planner Choi presented the staff report for this item. She stated that the architect revised the project based on the Design Review Committee's comments on the dormer windows. The revised plans also included a darker exterior stucco color. Staff was able to make the required findings and support the project as submitted.

Steve Dahl and Tammie Kallen, project architects, presented the project and answered questions from the Committee.

There were no public comments.

Majority of the Committee agreed that the required findings could be met for the addition project; the project is compatible with itself and with the neighborhood.

Committee Member Dustin expressed reservation with the inset dormers.

Committee Member Cheng moved to approve the project as submitted. Second by Committee Member Wong. AYES: Chairman Hsu, Committee Member Cheng, Committee Member Wong, and Alternate Committee Member Johnson-Brody. NOES: Committee Member Dustin.

**3. DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE CASE NO. DRC16-59
1040 OAK GROVE AVENUE, (PENG/GARDENS INC)**

Assistant Planner Choi presented the staff report for this item and stated that staff was in support of the project.

Steven Schultz, project contractor, provided background information on the project, presented the project and answered questions.

Stanislava Overholt, project designer, stated that the material sample of the fence is not available. She approached the dais and showed the Committee the fence color from a picture on her cellular phone.

The following people spoke in opposition of the project:

Catherine Tosetti, 1011 Oak Grove Avenue, stated that her objection to the design, material and limited setback of the gates.

Chris Norgaard, legal representative of the Jones family at 1100 Oak Grove Avenue, re-stated comments from the objection letter submitted by Louise Jones.

It was the consensus of the Committee that the proposed designs, materials and locations of the gates and fencing are not compatible with the neighborhood.

Committee Member Dustin moved to deny the project as submitted. Second by Committee Member Cheng. AYES: Chairman Hsu, Committee Member Cheng, Committee Member Dustin, Committee Member Wong, and Alternate Committee Member Johnson-Brody. NOES: None.

4. **DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE CASE NO. DRC16-41**
2260 ROBLES AVENUE, (DUN/HAN)

Committee Member Cheng recused himself from deliberation of the project and stepped out of the Council Chamber.

Assistant Planner Choi presented the staff report for this item. She stated that staff was in support of the project, finding the proposed addition to be well integrated with the existing structure. Staff recommended the Committee to continue the project in order for the architect to research for a roofing material that is currently available on the market and that best matches the roofing material on the existing structure.

Freeman Han, project architect, presented the project and answered questions.

There were no public comments.

Majority of the Committee agreed with staff findings and stated that a natural slate roofing material would be appropriate for the structure.

Committee Member Dustin moved to continue the project to the October 5, 2016 meeting. Second by Alternate Committee Member Johnson-Brody. AYES: Chairman Hsu, Committee Member Dustin, Committee Member Wong, Alternate Committee Member Johnson-Brody, and Alternate Committee Member Huang. NOES: None.

Committee Member Cheng entered the Council Chamber and returned to the dais.

5. **DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE CASE NO. DRC16-33**
2900 SHEFFIELD ROAD, (NORTHCOTT/CIRRITO)

Assistant Planner Choi presented the staff report for the single-story addition and exterior modification project and stated that staff was unable to make the required findings. Staff had design concerns related to the building height, window and roofing materials.

Michael Cirrito, project contractor, presented the project, answered questions and stated that his client would be agreeable to install the two-piece mission clay tiles as recommended by staff.

The following people spoke on the project:

Bob Horgan, 2835 Sheffield Road, stated that any work would be an improvement and questioned the future plans for the large detached garage in the rear yard.

Fran Benuska, 2410 Coniston Place, had questions on the detached garage.

The Committee agreed that the project will be an improvement on the property, however expressed concerns with the scale and visual massing of the structure, and visual impact of the street facing garage. The Committee also agreed that the proposed Spanish style is compatible with the neighborhood but stated that the front elevation needs additional articulation and the exterior design needs to provide more defining architectural features.

Committee Member Cheng stated that he found the proposed Spanish style structure incompatible with the neighborhood.

Committee Member Dustin moved to continue the project to the October 5, 2016 meeting. Second by Committee Member Wong. AYES: Chairman Hsu, Committee Member Cheng, Committee Member Dustin, Committee Member Wong, and Alternate Committee Member Johnson-Brody. NOES: None.

OTHER ITEM

6. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES FOR AUGUST 17, 2016.

Committee Member Dustin moved to approve the minutes as submitted. Second by Committee Member Cheng. AYES: Chair Hsu, Committee Member Cheng, Committee Member Dustin, Committee Member Wong, Alternate Committee Member Johnson-Brody. NOES: None.

OPEN FORUM

ADJOURNMENT

With no further items to consider, the DRC adjourned to the next regular Design Review Committee meeting on Wednesday, September 21, 2016 at 7:00 p.m. in the City Hall Council Chambers, 2200 Huntington Drive, San Marino, CA 91108.


AMANDA MERLO,
ASSOCIATE PLANNER